NATIONAL UNIVERSITY OF MONGOLIA,

PROCEEDINGS OF THE INTERNATIONAL CONFERENCE OF ASIAN PHILOSOPHICAL ASSOCIATION

ULAANBAATAR, MONGOLIA
PROCEEDINGS OF THE
INTERNATIONAL CONFERENCE OF
ASIAN PHILOSOPHICAL ASSOCIATION


NATIONAL UNIVERSITY OF MONGOLIA,
ULAANBAATAR, MONGOLIA
The organizers of the International Conference of Asian Philosophical Association ICAPA 2012:

- Asian Philosophical Association
- The School of Social Sciences, the National University of Mongolia

Schools and institutes collaborated on conference organization:

- The School of Law, the National University of Mongolia
- The school of economics, the National University of Mongolia
- The School of Mongolian Studies and Culture, the National University of Mongolia
- The School of Foreign Language and Cultures, the National University of Mongolia
- Institute of Philosophy, Sociology and Law, the Academy of Sciences Mongolia
- School of Social Technology, Mongolian University of Science and Technology

Special gratitude to Organizing Committee members:

Head of the Conference Organizing Committee,
Dr. O. Munkhbat, Vice President of Asian Philosophical Association, Head of Sociology and Social Work Department, the School of Social Sciences, the NUM

Members

- G. Erdenebayar
- O. Oyunjargal
- Ya. Otgonbayar
- J. Turtogtokh
- D. Oyungere
- N. Boldmaa
- B. Naranbaatar
- B. Dagzmaa
- J. Lhagvademchig
- Ts. Tsetsegjargal
- Z. Serik
- B. Munkhjavkhlan
- D. Sarantuya
- B. Urangoo
- B. Bayartsetseg
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

1. Mete Çamdereli
   Advertisement as a Paradigm of Social Development and Modern Turkey Concept of Advertisement ................................................................. 5

2. Hasan Yüksel, Orhan Adıgüzel, İbrahim Çetintürk
   THE CONCEPT OF URBANIZATION AS DILEMMA OR HARMONY IN MODERN LIFE ......................................................... 21

3. Aygün AKYOL
   MODERNIZATION OF OTTOMAN AND ITS REFLECTION ON REPUBLIC OF TURKEY ........................................... 33

4. Prof. Dr. Kazım SARIKAVAK
   İSLAM TASAVVUF DÜŞÜNÇESİNDE İLİM-ÂLEM İLİŞKİSİ MUHYİDDİN İBN-İ ARABI ÖRNEĞİ ......................................... 48

5. Kh Selenge, Ph.D. Prof.
   DEVELOPMENT OF MONGOLIANS’ LEGAL THINKING: TRADITION AND REFORM ........................................ 54

6. Mehmet Mahfuz SÖYLEMEZ’l
   Some Notes on History .............................................................................................................................................. 63

7. Son Byeongwook
   Nomadic cultural influence on Modernization of Korea ................................................................................. 68

8. ISHIDA Yuri
   ISLAMIC REFORM THOUGHT IN EIGHTEENTH-CENTURY INDIA:
   FOCUSING ON THE SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT THEORY OF ŞAYH WALİ ALLĀH .................................................. 70

9. Süleyman Doğan, Çiğdem Öztürklü
   COMPARISON OF THE WORKS OF HAY BIN YAKZAN
   AND ROBINSON CRUSOE IN RESPECT TO EDUCATIONAL PHILOSOPHY ....................................................... 75

10. Dr. Erhan ATAY, Dr. Gökhan KARSAN
    TO LOOK AT TURKISH MODERNIZATION FROM THE KOREAN MIRROR:
    A COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS ................................................................................................................................. 84

11. Anara Munkhjin, Darikhuu.R
    TRADITION AND MODERNITY—COMPARATIVE STUDY ON THE DEVELOPMENT OF
    PSYCHOANALYSIS IN JAPAN AND ITS CHARACTERISTIC—
    “MODERNITY WITHOUT TRADITION, IT ONLY LEADS TO DESTRUCTION” .................................................... 99
12. Taner GÖK
DIVAN (OTTOMAN) POET AGAINST THE WESTERNIZATION .......................................................... 111

13. SON TAEHO Ph.D.
THE PECULIARITIES OF HUMAN BEINGS AND ROBOETHICS (THE FUNDAMENTAL
DIFFERENCES BETWEEN HUMAN BEINGS AND ROBOTS IN REGARDS TO ROBOETHICS) .......... 121

14. Alparslan AÇIKGENÇ
A CLASSICAL PARADIGM OF SOCIAL HARMONY
IN ASIA THE CASE OF 'URF (LOCAL CULTURE) IN ISLAMIC LEGAL PHILOSOPHY .................... 127

15. Nurten Gökalp
THE VALUE OF MAN IN MAWLÂNĂ’S THOUGHTS ........................................................................ 139

16. Kadir Ayhan
POPULAR CULTURE AND EAST ASIAN REGIONALIZATION .......................................................... 144

17. Yong Yoon
KOREAN MIRACLE .......................................................................................................................... 155

18. Heejae Lee
THE TRANSFORMATION OF KOREAN CONFUCIANISM IN THE END OF JAPANESE IMPERIAL
PERIOD ............................................................................................................................................... 158

19. Prof. İlhan ÖZKEÇECİ
DECORATION PLANS OF SOME GREAT SELJUKID MINARETS .................................................... 159

20. Ebubekir Ceylan
RE-LOCATING ASIA IN THE HISTORY OF THE CIVILIZATIONS ................................................ 175

21. Tuncay BOLAT
İSMAIL GASPİRALI, ABDÜRREŞİT İBRAHİM AND MEHMET AKİF ERSOY’S IMPACT
AND THOUGHTS ON MODERNIZATION OF ASIA ........................................................................ 182

22. CHOI Woo-Won
DIALOGUE BETWEEN TRADITION AND MODERNITY IN CONTEMPORARY METAPHYSICS
THIS WORK WAS SUPPORTED BY A 2-YEAR RESEARCH GRANT OF PUSAN NATIONAL UNIVERSITY. 192

23. T.L.N.Swamy
NEW PARADIGMS OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: A CASE OF INDIA ............................................ 202

24. Michel Hong
LIFESTYLE AND KOREAN POLITICS: ............................................................................................ 205

25. Dae-Shik Lee
CHINA-KOREA ECONOMIC COOPERATION THROUGH FTA-CORPORATION’S PERSPECTIVE .. 221
26. Bayram Ali ÇETÎNKAYA
MODERN APPROACHES TO THE TRADITIONAL ISLAMIC MEDICINE ................................................... 222

27. Dr. O. Munkhbat
PARADIGM SHIFTS IN SOCIAL SCIENCES OF MONGOLIA .............................................................. 227

28. Dr. Gombosuren.TS
SOME PHILOSOPHICAL REFLECTION RELATED TO EPISTEMOLOGICAL ISSUE ........................................... 232

29. İbrahim ÇETİN TÜR K, Yekta HALICI, Orhan ER, Mustafa KAVUT
ECONOMIC CONTRIBUTION OF THE TOURISM SECTOR TO MONGOLIA: PREDICTION USING ARTIFICIAL NEURAL NETWORKS ............................................................ 243

30. Hamidullah Marazi
ISLAMIC PERIMETERS OF INTER-RELIGIOUS DIALOGUE .............................................................................. 253

31. THE STUDY OF FORMING THE PERCEPTION OF SAFETY AND THE PERSPECTIVE TOWARDS APPROPRIATE GUIDANCE FOR MARINE SPORTS INSTRUCTORS ......................... 261

32. Jang, Jae-yong, Kwon, Oh-ryun, So, Hoon
VALUE OF SPORT FOR ALL AS NEW-NATIONALISM PHYSICAL EDUCATION ........................................... 264

33. Kim, Sun-hee, Kwon, Oh-ryun, So, Hoon
STUDY ON COMMUNITY DANCE AND ITS EDUCATIONAL VALUE AS THE ART OF DANCING ........................................... 266

34. Hoon So, Young-Seong Hwang, Hyeon-Jo Yoo, Seon-Mi Jang, Jae-Sung
Park, Joo-Hyeok Kim, Hyun-Woo Park
A STUDY ON HEALTH SATISFACTION LEVEL AND LEISURE SATISFACTION LEVEL ACCORDING TO SKIN SCUBA DIVING PARTICIPATION ............................................................ 270

35. Hyeon-Jo Yoo, Young-Seong Hwang, Seon-Mi Jang, Hoon So, Jae-Sung Park, Joo-Hyeok Kim, Hyun-Woo Park
ANALYSIS OF TENNIS MALE DOUBLES GAME DETAILS ............................................................ 272

36. Dr. Park, Hyun-Woo
THE EFFECT OF THE SPORT TRAINING ON IMPROVEMENT OF THE CREATIVITY ........................................... 278

37. Jeang, Il-hong
VALUE OF KARATEDO TRAINING AS SECURITY GUARD MARTIAL ART ........................................... 281

38. Seo Jin Seok
STUDY ON THE IDEAS OF PUBLIC AND ENTERPRISE CHARACTERISTICS IN PRIVATE SECURITY LAW ............................................................ 288
39. T.Dorjdagva, PhD
SOME IDEAS TO THE PROBLEM “EAST AND WEST” ................................................................. 239

40. Dagzmaa.B, PhD, Munkhjavkhlan.B, MA
COMPARATIVE STUDY ON THE ONTOLOGICAL ISSUE OF VEDANTA PHILOSOPHY AND PLATONISM ................................................................. 296

41. Dashdondog Enkhbat (Ph.D)
QUANTITATIVE ANALYSIS OF FORENAME AND GIVEN NAME FREQUENCIES ............................................ 300

42. Heon-sik Yoo
PHILOSOPHICAL EXPLANATION OF THE GROWTH ENGINE OF MODERN KOREA ........................................ 308

43. Amantai Khajyet
A COMPARATIVE ANALYZE OF PLATO’S DOCTRINE OF EROS IN THE SYMPOSIUM AND PHAEDRUS ................................................................. 316

44. Nobuto. Iwata
EAST ASIAN COUNTRIES AND MULTI/PLURI-LATERAL FREE TRADE ISSUES ........................................ 329

45. Yasuhito ISHII
ON SOME FEATURES OF HUMAN LANGUAGE FACULTY ........................................................................ 340

46. Sholpan Davletova
THE STEPPES OF CENTRAL ASIA AND CLIMATE CHANGE: MITIGATION AND ADAPTATION ................................................................. 346

47. TUNGALAG.D, PhD
THE MORAL VALUE IS ONE OF THE FACTS OF SOCIAL CHANGES ........................................................................ 352

48. Sukhbat Soyolmaa
THE SYMBOLIC THEORY OF MYTH AND SOME IDEA ABOUT «THE SECRET HISTORY OF THE MONGOLS» ........................................................................ 356

49. Sarantuya Dagvadorj, PhD
CONSTITUTIONALISM IN PRACTICE ................................................................................................. 361

50. Sc.D, Dashpurev.D
MONGOLIA: THE PAST AND THE PRESENT ................................................................................................. 364

51. Mehmet GÜMÜŞKILIÇ
SIMILARITIES BETWEEN MONGOLIAN AND TURKISH ........................................................................ 380

52. Gantumur Begz, (Ph.D), Oyungerel Dashdorj, Ph.D)
SOME QUESTIONS OF ASIAN PHILOSOPHY ................................................................................................. 384

53. Assoc.Prof. Ayse Canatan
IN MONGOLIAN AND TURKISH PROVERBS, AGING AND ELDERLY FROM THE SOCIOLOGICAL VIEWPOINT ........................................................................ 388
Aygün AKYOL
Assist. Prof. Dr. Hitit University, Divinity Faculty,
Department of Islamic Philosophy,
aygunakyol@yahoo.com

MODERNIZATION OF OTTOMAN AND ITS REFLECTION ON REPUBLIC OF TURKEY

Introduction:
Turkey has been affected by Ottoman historically, culturally and institutionally. A new republic has been founded, a new identity and a new modernization project that is proper to this innovation (identifying with this westernization) was started. We, as Turkey Muslims, have experienced that this modernization zeal is a cultural identity crisis which has a two hundred year background. At this point reached today, how succesful have we been? To answer this, we shall try to analyse the notion of “reform” focusing on Said Halim Pasha who was one of the prepotent people of final period of Ottoman philosophy.

In our study, firstly we will examine the notion and context of the reform, later on we shall mention the solution suggestions offered in Ottoman. At this point reached today, how succesful have we been? To answer this, we shall try to analyse the notion of “reform” focusing on Said Halim Pasha who was one of the prepotent people of final period of Ottoman philosophy and who was a grand vizier in Ottoman bureaucracy and who worked as a manager in the Committee of Union and Progress.

A. THE NOTION OF REFORM
The fact that there were missing parts when met the west in Ottoman was understood by the rulers. However there were two points, which draw attention, in the solution suggestions about how to handle these troubles.

The word reform (ıslah in Turkish, Ottoman), is the name of the deed which is done to overcome intrigues.32 “Islah” which derives from the root “salah” which means to be good and beneficial in the dictionary is generally used in the sense of to fix, to make better.33

References:
31Said Halim Pasha, born in 1864 in Cairo. He was the grandson of Egypt Governor Kavalali Mehmed Ali Pasha, son of Mehmet Abdulhalim Pasha who is member of Council of State. In 1888, Said Halim was appointed to the membership of Council of State. In 1903, he was expelled from Istanbul by asserting that he was associated with Young Turks. In the period of his grand viziership, he displayed sensitivity in the case of retaking of Edirne and in the case of the Islands. Due to his efforts to retake Edirne he was given token of Bejeweled Royalty. In the congresses of Union and Progress held in 1913 and 1916, he was elected for the chairman of the organization. After Mondros Ceasefire Agreement he was sent to High Council with the assertion of responsibility for war and “Armenian Genocide”. On 10 March, 1919, he was apprehended and judged in Council of War Custom, in 1919 he was expelled firstly to Mondros and then to Malta. In 1921 he was released, yet his request to return to Istanbul was rejected. He rented a residence in Rome and moved there. On 5 December, 1921 he was killed by an Armenian in front of the residence. For more information about the life and works of Said Halim Pasha please look at: Esref Eşref Bey. İslam Alemi için Pek Büyük Bir Kayıp, Buhranlarımız içinde, sad.: Erdoğru Düzdağ, İz Yay., İstanbul 1991, ss.XXXIX, XLVIII; M. Henefi Bostan. Said Halim Paşa mad., İA., İstanbul 2008. c. 35, ss. 557, 560; N. Ahmet Özalp, Sunuş, Said Halim Paşa, Siyasal Kurumlar içinde, Pınar Yay., İstanbul 1987, ss. 9-14; Ertuğrul Düzdağ, Said Halim Paşa Hayatı ve Eserleri, Buhranlarımız içinde, İz Yay., İstanbul 1991, ss. XIII, XXXVII;
out in the application of the system which they found on their own religious and national
priorities and axioms.\(^{34}\)

Reform movements can be evaluated in two parts, one of them is the notion of
"renewal/novation" and the other is the notion of "regeneration/innovation". The notion of
novation is described as "inwardly innovation".\(^{35}\) It is the common name of the enterprises
done to make the principles of Islam dominant on those days' Muslim, by premiuming the
religious values and overcoming the suspicion among them. In a way it is the effort to
reinterpret and understand its own dynamics.\(^{36}\) The following statement which is mentioned
as the novation hadith of the Prophet is important, in the sense of that the movement of
novation is accepted in Islamic World. "Without doubt, Glorious Allah is going to send
someone to novate their religious lifes of the Islam nation in the beginning of each century."\(^{37}\)
According to this hadith, the religion of Islam will maintain its continuity by renewing
constantly.

For the movement of novation to be succesful, a double-way knowledge is necessary.
Primarily, after the formation of traditional knowledge related to all the aspects of the life, and
as a parallel to this, the formation of modern knowledge, after this ideal substructure is
formed, a specific, new knowledge and science understanding (modal) should be formed. In
the movement of novation there way two important ways. One of them is that the Quran and
sunnah will be taken into consideration and the other one is that Islam will be experienced in a
new style in that certain period.

The second type of approach in the reform movements is the notion of "regeneration". In
the Islamic world. It is to conduct studies which based on the data on another system of
thought, instead of seeking solutions by the original sources of polit-mental disintegrations
which gained momentum between 17th and 19th centuries. In other words, to interpret Islam
as "outside-in innovation" by focusing on foreign thought principles is called regeneration.\(^{38}\)

In this context we can mention that, the efforts of every culture related to re-organize
its own structure by bearing in mind the internal and external conditions is called
novation/modernity, the effort of every culture to fix its own structure by taking example of
another element in the same way is called regeneration/modernism. When analysing
modernization, we can state that these two perspective is basically dominant in different
tonations.\(^{39}\)

We call modernism that the west imposes its own modernity understanding, by
idealizing it to the unique innovation/reform/modernization, to the non-western communities.
For we center this determinism, we divide the Reform movements into two based on
Fazlurrahman as pre-modernist and post-modernist. We clarify that pre-modernist reform
movements are called novation, post-modernist reform movements are called

\(^{34}\) Mevlüt Uyanık, *Sivil İtaatsizlik Eylemleri ve Dini Değerler*, Elif Yay., Ankara 2010, p. 25; Osmanlı Düşünce


\(^{36}\) Mevlüt Uyanık, "Günümüz İslam Dünyasında İslahat Kavramı", İslami Araştırmalar Dergisi, 1990, vol. 4, no:
1, s.49; Karşıt Fikir Kavramı, s.60


\(^{38}\) Uyanık, "Günümüz İslam Dünyasında İslahat Kavramı", s. 49; "Karşıt Fikir Kavramı", p. 60; "Küreselleşme

regeneration. 40 This notional differentiation is done based on Mevdudi. We make equal novation movements to modernity, and regeneration movements to modernism. 41

**OTTOMAN REFORM EXPERIENCE**

When analysed to structure of Otoman Empire, the fact that it has on original structure draws attention. With the rights given to Muslim and non-Muslim citizens, it drew its strength from the fact that the community is structured according to the occupations and functions. This structure that protect its stability for a long time swayed with the new phenomenon (nationalism) that French Revolution brought. In this case non-Muslim elements in Ottoman based on the system of *nation* began to demands new rights. 42 Financial situation in Ottoman was always going worse and wose due to the negativity which is caused by regular industrialization as a consequence of geographical explorations and capitulations. These negativities motivated Ottoman to search for the source of the problem. In this point Ottoman entered into a Project of modernization.

At the end of this process, the movement of westernization appeared in a salient way. Westernization is called as political, social and cultural movements maintained to reach to the developmental level of the West in the transitional of Ottoman to the Republic of Turkey. 43 Diversity of solution suggestions show us the formation of three different intellectual and political movements which appeared in the late Ottoman period and still exist today. All of the suggestions aim to save from High Ottoman Empire from its condition. Remarkable points of these three movements are that they try to make the state modernized. Despite this common aim, there were serious division of opinions among them as to which method would be used. The different approached can be mentioned under the titles of, *Westernism, Nationalism and Pan-Islamism.*

According to the defenders of *Westernism*, mankind based on advancing and improving should now follow the dominant world of value. In that sense, for the West is the dominant world of value, it was necessary to follow and adopt it for salvation. Yet Westernization was not only restricted with the transfer of knowledge and technology, but it also imposed that a global, and uniformitarian way of life should be structured into ideological patterns with the transfer of culture and value. 44

Westernization is a term derived from the effort that a system of knowledge and value is transferred to other cultures. With the Enlightenment, nominalist approach which emphasizes particulars as opposed to plenary judgment of church doctrin became prominent, church weakened because metaphysical values are perceived with the system of positivist knowledge. 45 Within this scope, God-centred envisagement of the world was supplanted with human-centred envisagement of the world. This change in giving the meaning of the life gave birth to the new thought forms called modernity and modernism. 46

In this sense, Westernism movement seen as a solution way in Ottoman Modernization can be understood when look inwardly. Because a community needs to produce

---

41 Mevdudi, w.m., p. 43-51.
a series of alternative thoughts to innovate itself. Yet if we look at westrnization movement outwardly, for westerners, Ottoman modernization is a make-it-westernized movement. And it was seen as an Eastern Question. 47

Nationalism is the type of thought which aims that the communities belonging the common cultural or ethnic roots in a certain geography be dignified with the political and historical legitimacy and which demands that the national state be strengthen with political, social, cultural and religious thought and approaches. 48 When we look at this movement, it can be seen that it affected Ottoman with the nationalism movement in the West after the French Revolution. At first, this attitude towards nationalism is quite unfavourable. It is the propensity of preventing the spread Nationalism among non-Muslim people of Ottoman Empire, to provide the unification of the state which contains a lot of people. 49

The idea of nationalism at first appeared to provide an equality principle in life to form an Ottoman national among different nation, and secondly, in a romantic style that asserts and idea of native country. 50 Perception of nationalism on Ottoman first happen in that context, because it is hard for Ottoman which consists of different ethnic elements to adopt a western style nationalism idea. For this reason the style of Ottoman to interpret this thought appeared as Ottomanism. 51

Ottoman Empire knitted with different nations who met the intense pres of nationalist ideology, in the beginning tried to turn it into Ottomanist ideology, yet failed to do so. Akçuraoglu Yusuf, in the Turkish newspaper which issued in 1904, in Cairo, in his text published with the title of “Three Style of Policy” 52 defended Pan-turkism based on bloodline fraternity instead of Ottomanism and Pan-Islamism of Abdulhamit II period. 53

In paralel with the abandoning of the system of recruitment in 17th century and the spread of nationalist ideology among the Muslim people of Ottoman, this movement which began as Ottomanism, turning into the movement of Turkism became a powerful ideology. 54 This solution suggestion interpreted as Turkish concord, adopted the ideal of formation of a national state with the unification of the Turks who spread all over the world, which would unify the Turks in the sense of religion and race. Thus, because Ottoman is the most powerful, most advanced and most civilized of all Turkish communities, it would be the most significant one. 55

This idea appeared as west-axial, innovated itself in the Ottoman political life. Because the idea of nationalism in Ottoman is evaluated differently in terms of quality and roots from in the idea of nationalism in the West, certain troubles occur. There is some difficulty in analysing the national idea in Ottoman with the notions of the West. 56 In this sense, western nationalism is fully at the service of modernism. Te more the imperialist tendencies in the West gained power and reached to a threatening level for other nations, the

---

47 Osman Kafadar, Türk Eğitim Düşüncesinde Batılılaşma, Vadi Yay., Ankara 1997, p. 65
48 Azmi Özcan, “Milliyetçilik mad.”, IA., Istanbul, 2005. v. 30, p. 84, 85
49 Ercüment Kuran, Türkiye'nin Battılılaşması ve Milli Meseleler, TDV. Yay. İstanbul, 1994, p.67
50 Look at: Mümtaz’er Türköne, Osmanlı Modernleşmesinin Kökleri, İz Yay., İst. 1991
53 Ercüment Kuran, w.m., p. 67
54 İlber Ortaylı, Imparatorluğun En Uzun Yüzyılı, İletişim Yay., Istanbul 2000, p. 61 Ercüment Kuran, age., p. 65, 67
56 İlber Ortaylı, w.m., p. 87
more the nationalism got attached to its roots and traditions. In this context the perception of the communities in the past to be a nation cannot be evaluated in the same way as the nationalism understandings which modern period brought.57

In the period when the ideology of nation state in the West spread, the nationalism idea that can be described as Pan-Turkism was interpreted in different forms, saved from racist discourse and tried to gain a steady basis. In such structures, bloodline, nation and native country elements was divided and tried to be prevented from racist discrimination.58 Location of nation that we encountered in Ottoman modernization and locution of Islam nation appeared in the line of its usage is the reflection of notion of nation in Europe. It cannot be expected from Ottoman to develop a secular nationalism as in the West, because it did not go through the phases which the West experienced. It is not surprising that the ideological basis of Ottomanism and Turkism was full of Islamic elements. The first Turkists in Ottoman adopted a nationalism based on culture and ideal of native country instead of bloodline and language.59

When we look at the movement of Pan-Islamism, we see that it is described as “a movement which contains all the political, ideological, scientific studies, searches, suggestions and solutions of which activist, modernist, eclectical aspects are dominant, and which made in order for Islam to be dominant “again” on life as a whole (faith, praying, ethics, philosophy, politics, law, education) and with a rationalist method, to save Muslims and world of Islam from Western exploitation, cruel and despotic rulers, captivity, imitation and superstition, to civilize, unify and develop them.”60

Political thoughts of Islamists can be defined as to save the Muslims of all the world from being the exploitee of Europe, the despotic rule over them and to provide them their independency.61 Islamists tried to show that there is no conflict between science and religion to the westerners and Muslims, and thought that it is a principle that should be proved. In this sense they began to adopt determinism and express the discourse of natural law. Attitude of past ulema and the parts of religious data which are related to the miracles and cannot be explained obstructed the Islamists. It was the sign of secularization which draws attention in the discourses of Islamists.62

Islamism can be seen as one of the moves which occur to protect Ottoman’s dominance. In this context it is a religious, political bearing which appear for Muslim communities in Ottoman lands to protect themselves.63

Islamist was in favour of a partial westernization. While they adopted return to Şer-i Şerif before modernism, at the end of the modernism they adopted an eclectical method. (Let us take the example of the science and knowledge of the west, not the ethics and spirituality)
because western civilization is the dominant one, they moved in a defensive approach rather not an offensive one.64

The ideology of “Let us take the example of the science and knowledge of the west, not the ethics and spirituality “which Islamist movement expressed in its innovation effort would be perceived to have some difficulties. The japanese are seen as the ones who can achieve this at the best level. Yet when the Japanese analysed more closely, it will be seen that they are the closest community to the West in terms of world of values.65 It was impossible to see the dilemma of this thought in that period.of Ottoman. However, long experiences showed that this did not develop in the way that Islamists want.

It is necessary to differentiate between Islamism in the Turkish thought history and the style of thought called as fundamentalism. Islamist thought in Turkey is not a daily-movement but is one of the three elements of Ottoman modernization. Thought system which called as political Islam today perhaps has a position in the Turkish thought history but according to us it does not have a philosophical and historical background. Because Turkey started to confront with the west in 18th c. and it began to find a solution.

Among the thinkers referred as Islamist, the idea that deficiancy in the Islam world stemmed from backslide from the self was dominant. In this condition, as a solution, it was necessary to go back to Islam’s purity.66 In this perspective, Islamists experienced an attitude of thought which has three levels. The first level was the idea that the West is absolute evil. At the second level they adopted a reconcilationary structure. At the third level, they exhibited a defensive approach rather than an offensinve one and forgot the deeds they actually should do.67

Westernist found the solution to salvation against Europe to surrender. Even Islamists tried to prove that Islam did not conflict with the modern life. Turkist boasted about their winnings in the history, meanwhile they re-interpreted the history to find the reasons we cannot be powerful as Europeans.68 There was a common point which all these three movement agree, which can be expressed as “being contemporary”. Yet there were disagreement as to the methods which would be used for this to happen. Another common point of these three movements were the idea that reform problems stemmed form the confrontation with the Western Civilization. At this point there were disagreements about what and how would be taken from Western civilization.69 In this part of our study we want to explain Said Halim Pasha’s, who draws attention as a bureaucrat in the late Ottoman period, solution suggestions as to reform subject

B. SAİT HALM PASHA’S REFORM UNDERSTANDING

Salim pahsa who was one of the important representavie of Islamist political thought in the late Ottoman period, is a different person who is described as Islamist who played an active role in the Unionist goverments in the Ottoman political life.70 Inasmush as next period Islamists also benefited from the thoughts of famous thinkers such as Mehmet Akit and Said

64 İsmail Kara, Türkiye’de İslâmcılık, Iz Yay., Ist., 1995, p.17
65 İlber Ortaylı, w.m., p. 23
66 Osman Kafadar, w.m., p. 215.
68 Erol Güngör, Türk Kültürü ve Milliyetçilik, Ötüken Yay., İstanbul, 2011, p.72
69 Mustafa Gündüz, “II. Meşrutiyet Dönemi Türkçü, İslami ve Batıçılı Görlüşlere Mensup Aydınların Toplumsal Değişme Telakkileri”, Muhafazakâr Düşünce, y.1, v. 4, Bahar 2005, s. 109; Osman Kafadar, op. cit, p. 127
70 Tarık Zafer Tunaya, Türkiye’de Siyasal Partiler, İletişim Yay., İstanbul 1998, v.1 p.42, 58
Halim Pasha. In this sense the thoughts of Said Halim Pasha who personally experienced the problems of Ottoman are significant for us at the point of analysing some part of the reaction that Islamists have when confronting with the West.

Said Halim Pasha mentioned that a community’s own values should be prioritized in reforms. According to him, a community should form its own model by grounding on its own traditional and intellectual structure and by bearing in mind other systems of thought if there is any. In that sense Constitutionalism, Basic Law, was seen as a stranger to Islam and Ottoman State. Because according to Said Halim Pasha, the constitutions such as democract and senate would not be appropriate because there are not classes in Islamic communities. It would not be appropriate to compare the women rights in Islam with the feminism emerged as a Westerner notion, because the meanings of liberty and equality notions in Islam are different.

I. The Reasons of Social Problems
Said Halim Pasha addresses to the malfunctions in the basic structure, social disintegrity and not benefiting enough from our religion, as the reason why Ottoman needed the reform. First of them is the structural disintegrates.

a. Constitutional Differences and Social Disintegration
According to Said Halim Pasha, since there was not a class society like in Western societies, there couldn’t be democratization in Western style. Since there was not an elite class among Muslims, their process of democratization would not consist of the phases the same as Westerners. The democratization would come true with populist opinion spreading among rulers. But the concept of Islamic society’s democratization is still a Western concept. The fact that Said Halim Pasha adopted this fact shows that he didn’t reject all Western concepts.

However, a social class difference occurred when intellectuals who were sent to West to understand the reforms, fully adopted the values of the West and constituted an intellectual class who were disconnected from their own values. According to Said Halim Pasha since this intellectual class couldn’t reach to the public their bounds with the public was broken and it led extensive negative reactions among intellectuals.

Said Halim Pasha states that a concept of equality which is based on Islam is different from the West’s social structure which is based on the interests of different groups and classes. He sees the the straggle of carrying this social structured based on classes to Ottoman as the basic problem which causes structural distortion. According to Said Halim Pasha, ‘According to European ideas and beliefs, political unity consists of the people who are connected to each other by unity of language and sects. Ottoman political unity does not depend on nationality like in Christian governments it depends on Islamic unity and brotherhood.”

71 Mustafa Gündüz, op. ci., p. 112
73 Said Halim Paşa, ibid., s. 171
74 Said Halim Paşa, ibid., s. 86, 87
75 Said Halim Paşa, ibid., s. 103.
76 Said Halim Paşa, ibid., s. 27.
For this reason Said Halim Pasha says that the antagonism and hostility in European governments cannot take place in Ottoman Empire and from this point of view he says that Ottoman does not need a Western style group and party mentality. Because this aggressive and self-seeker party mentality would affect Ottoman’s political structure negatively. Said Halim Pasha emphasize that Ottoman political unity should reorganize itself within the frame of unity and brotherhood. This unity had appeared differently at different times. The basic problem was being unable to form an original pattern at the mentioned time and place.

One of the basic problems which Ottoman modernization project faced was the fact that Western nationalism appeared in Ottoman society in different ways. Independence and liberation movements that came with French revolution started to determine Ottoman’s political and administrative structure which was dependent on nations. The principle of equality appeared in Ottoman in different groups and that transformed into principle of national freedom in time.77

Also, capitulations and various privileges given to West was one of the most important factors that damaged the structure of Ottoman which had been dropped behind economically. It has been stated that the fact that the state was in economical insufficiency was one of the most important reasons for the decline of the Ottoman. Financial impossibilities wrecked social order.78 The fact that the education system was not revised led Ottoman which was far from the information and science mentality came with enlightenment to be unable to from a scientific mentality.79

West was known to Ottoman which had financial and moral losses as aggressive and colonist. Also the West was taking advantage of the fact that Ottoman was in the decline phase by extorting its lands. In such an atmosphere in Ottoman there was an inner reaction against West among people including intellectuals and ordinary people. This reaction started to constitute an impediment to see the informational a scientific development of the West. So West was perceived as an enemy instead of being understood and defined. This also hindered the solution.80

Said Halim Pasha sees one of the reasons of decline as Muslim’s being unable to benefit from their religion. This also has several reasons. One of them is the effects of the pre-Islam life. Islam emerged in a specific cultural atmosphere to specific cultural groups. The cultural groups that embraced Islam afterwards combined their value judgments with religious reality. Every nation uses its own way of life and perception in religious context. And that caused many differences in the way of perceiving and practicing Islam. Above all when the concept of time was added to this ground many differences emerged I both understanding the text and practicing Islam. Said Halim Pasha believes that these differences caused Islam not to be understood and Islamic societies declined because of this reasons.81 Another reason is that the religion couldn’t be interpreted for new needs. For this reason necessary solutions couldn’t be created about the situations that were faced with.

77 Bernard Lewis Modern Türkiye’nin Doğuşu, tr.: Metin Kıratlı , TTK.Yay., p. 56
78 Said Halim Paşa, ibid., s.247 - 248
79 Said Halim Paşa, ibid., f. 255; At this point some suggestions were made to transfer the information and values of the West. One of them is the concept of ‘islamization of the information’. For this see Mevlüt Uyanık, Bildirin Islamiştrilmesi ve Çağdağ Islam Daşıncesi, Ankara Okulu Yay., Ankara 1999, p. 99-160; Mevlüt Uyanık, Çağdaş Islam Bilimine Giriş, ed.: Mevlüt Uyanık, Feer Yay., Ankara, 2012, p. 21-43.
81 Said Halim Paşa, ibid., s.154, 159.
b. Mistakes That Were Made in Reform Movements

Said Halim Pasha states that while creating solutions some problems occurred after it was understood that there had been structural problems. He states that among all these problems the most important is creating solutions in a hurry without understanding the problems. At this point the most obvious mistake is transferring the systems that were thought to be working in Western societies directly. Said Halim Pasha says that on the basis of this there is a belief that ‘for development Western social, political concepts and institutions should be transferred directly'. However systems and organizations of the West gain meaning in their cultural and political process. Their success is also evaluated within this frame. It is wrong to present this system of values which is constituted for another region as an unchangeable reality. Within this frame according to Said Halim Pasha it is wrong to transfer European judicial and administrative system by making some changes and seek solution in this way.⁸²

Reforms that were made in such grounds did not suit both social and political structure of the country. That is why they failed. Thereupon instead of seeking for new solutions people sought for new politicians who were able to administer the West’s information system properly. Said Halim Pasha states that organizations are constituted by developing their selves by a nation’s self and cultural background. It is an illusion to believe that social conditions can be changed by changing political structure.⁸³

A mistake that can be counted as a continuation of the mistake that we mentioned above is to assume every change to result positively. However the important thing is to know that societal institutions and establishments are born, grow and die within the society. At this point the most important mistake is to change the institution radically which fails instead of reforming it. What is needed to be done is to reform the defective parts of the institutions by using experience.⁸⁴ It has been always problematic to prefer a new institution instead of reform. Because the new institution firstly causes loss of time, secondly it eradicates the former institution lastly it increases the possibility of failure. In case of a failure there would be a chaos in social and political arenas. Society would try to uncover and solve this problem with other institutions. And this would not reduce the structural problems of this society and institutions but it would increase them. For this reason the struggle for reform would result in a more positive way.

II. Suggestions of Said Halim Pasha

Said Halim Pasha advocates that the approaches about reforms should be discussed from the society’s own point of view and suggestions that are valid for a society should not be imposed on other societies. At this point the most important element is intellectual wealth.

Acquiring the Intellectual Wealth

Said Halim Pasha emphasizes that to understand the social problems and to create solutions for them firstly ‘it is necessary to have the information that is enough to compare our own society with the others'. For a systemic development it is a must to know your own community with its primary resources, socio-cultural, ethnic and economical structure and evaluate it in this frame. A person can only know the needs of society by knowing his or her

⁸² Said Halim Paşa, ibid., s. 14
⁸³ Said Halim Paşa, ibid., p. 23
⁸⁴ Said Halim Paşa, ibid., p. 64
own cultural background. In this context each society's development occurs in different ways. For this reason people who practice reforms should have the information enough to detect failures and capacity to criticize because a person's who is unaware of his or her own society suggestion would be artificial and superficial. Even if these suggestions are applied they may result in more serious disasters instead of solutions.85

Said Halim Pasha states that to create an intellectual identity that is aware of his or her own cultural identity education institutions should teach people their nation's and culture's real values and the effects of this should be seen in practice. Only in this way we can have information about ourselves enough to compare our community with the others.86

The second phase of acquiring the intellectual wealth is to know about the West and its ideological and political history. To understand West's civilization their values and institutionalization that progressed in accordance with them should be understood fully. According to Said Halim Pasha the West should be understood and interpreted very well because we can compare the civilizations only when we understand the internal structure of them. By understanding the civilization we mean not to consider issues from a Westener's point of view but to consider them by putting our own cultural values on the center. Its purpose is to reveal how we can use this information within our own civilization and to describe the breaking point. If we can achieve that we will have the chance of constructing a new structure.87

Said Halim Pasha says what is necessary for our civilization to develop in these words 'We should benefit from that community for our national advance. Our job is to take the necessary things for development of our civilization from the West and administer them to ourselves.'88

The point in understanding the West is to develop new forms of solutions while reforming our institutions. What we need to do in our approach to the West is not to see the West as a dogma and bless it and again not to see it as an unchangeable enemy and put it away. The point that stands out here is that the West constructed an original civilization and it constantly interferes with social and political structures of other cultures. It is normal for other civilizations to show negative reactions against these interferences. While facing with the West we should accept the fact that the West has an information system and we should know this system well and seek for benefiting from it like the way the West benefitted from our information system by creating a new information system.89

a. Reforming Institutions
Social and political institutions are institutions that exist with their own past and develop or regress by cultural background. The social function of these institutions is very important. According to Said Halim Pasha if these institutions cannot carry out their functions it is too

85 Said Halim Paşa, ibid., p. 68; Ibn Haldun also states that there had been ideological deficiencies in understanding social malfunction through Islamic ideological history and he made suggestion for this issue. See: Aylın Akyol, “İbn Haldun’un İlim Anlayışında Felsefe ve Tarih Tasavvuru”, Hitit Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi, 2011/2, cilt: 10, volume: 20, p. 48, 49
86 Said Halim Paşa, ibid., p. 68
87 Said Halim Paşa, ibid., p. 76, 77.
88 Said Halim Paşa, ibid., p.77.
89 Said Halim Paşa, ibid., p.57, 'we should know them as well as possible. But our aim should not be transferring the same thing they did but it should be to understand how difficult and important is our job and to get more information to carry out our duty in the best way.
easy to solve the problem by quitting the institutional structure. For renewed institutions to fill the gap for old institutions they need to reflect the social structure and be in accordance with it fully. If it is not in accordance with it then you will have lost the institution that belongs to society and will not have been able to construct a new one.90

For this reason firstly we should determine our institutions’ past and ‘why they were constructed, how they function’. And then we should seek for an answer for the question ‘Why don’t they function like they did?’91 so we should reinterpret our own political and social structure in the light of new information and we should reorganize them in accordance with the society instead of changing it.

Education is the first of social institutions. It is clear that constructing educational institutions productively and effectively will cause the reform of the society to stand on a solid ground may be not immediately but surely after a while. In resolution suggestions about reforms the idea that ‘we should find solutions for troubles in education and we should adopt the West’s discipline and science’ is important. But education institutions should be reformed very carefully since the mistakes being made in these institutions show themselves in the long run. In education institutions society’s core values should be taken into consideration. According to Said Halim Pasha ‘If the systems of English, French and German are good it is because they aim at raising good English, good French and good German. So it is impossible for a nation’s education system to be in accordance with the others.’92 That is why our own values should be taken into consideration in reforms in educational institutions.

At this point there is religion as an element which provides unity of the society. With the perception of the West world as the absolute power Islamic societies started to seek the reason for their drawback in the deficiency of understanding and practicing the religion.93 Said Halim Pasha states his approach to understanding the religion as ‘We first see the reason of our drawback as our inability to understand and practice Islam better. Today we see the reason of our drawback not as our fault and neglect but as our religions deficiency.’94 At this point Said Halim Pasha states that the religion should be understood well.

When the first problems came out in Ottoman Koçi Bey said that the reason for the decline was religion’s incompliancy in its basic system.95 This idea which was stated in the first periods caused some intellectuals to see the religion problematic because of the domination of the West. In this context Said Halim Pasha states that the idea that the religion was the reason for the decline was the religion was not true but there were some problems about understanding and practicing religion.

Conclusion
With the decline of the Ottoman the suggestion to stop this decline made reforms necessary. But the approaches on how these reforms should be made caused different ideological and philosophical ideas to come out. At this point the example of Republic of Turkey has a quality

90 Said Halim Paşa, ibid., p. 53, 54.
91 Said Halim Paşa, ibid., p.42
92 Said Halim Paşa, ibid
94 Said Halim Paşa, ibid., p 43-45
95 Said Halim Paşa, ibid., p. 43-45
to present various experiences and examples about the manner of the countries against the West.

In Ottoman modernization in which there were three different approaches Occidentalism, Nationalism and Islamism went on in various forms and they had their places in history of Republic of Turkey. Even though they had different suggestions for solution they provide the continuity of the state and development of the society. Said Halim Pasha as an intellectual called as Islamist tried to find out the reasons for the decline and made suggestions to solve the problems. At this point the important thing to take into consideration while making reforms is the fact that different societies’ suggestions for solutions cannot be in accordance with each other fully so each nation should find its own way of reform. What is needed to be done is to have the intellectual wealth to understand the problems of society, to find solutions for them and to make our institutions more functional without demolishing our social structure and institutions. For this reason first educational institutions and perception of religion should be well constructed in social structure.

As Said Halim Pasha states while creating solutions for social problems to act in a hurry will make the situations even worse instead of being stable solutions. Actually the aim of the people who make suggestions for social life may be to overcome the problematic situation. But the good intentions should not be a ground for legalizing the mistakes.

While creating solutions for the problems instead of trial and error we should make the changes with information and considering and evaluating the risks. If trial and error is accepted as a method it is possible to cause some unchangeable defects in the social life. If the dynamic structure of the social life and irreversibility of the mistakes are taken into consideration the losses of the mistakes can be seen more clearly. That is why when making radical changes it is necessary for us to think how to fill the gap after demolishing the existing one.
Visual References

- Carter V. Findley, Modern Türkiye Tarihi İslam Milliyetçilik ve Modernlık (Modern Turkey’s History Islam, Nationalism and Modernity), İstanbul, Timas Yay., 2011, s.17
- Şerif Mardin, Türk Modernleşmesi (Turkish Modernization), İstanbul, İletişim Yay., 2011, s.11-13
- Cumhuriyet Türkiye’sinde Siyasal İktidarların Benimsedikleri Giyim Tarzları ile İdeolojileri Arasındaki İlişkisel ve Siyasal İçerikli Giyim Kodları Arayışı (Relationality between Clothing Styles that Political Powers adopt to and their Ideologies in Republican Turkey and A Seek For Politically Related Clothing Codes), İstanbul, İÜSBE, Yayınlanmamış Doktora Tezi, 2012, s.202.
- Ayşegül Başbugu-Yaraman, “La Femme turque dans son parcours emancipatoire (de l’empire otoman a la republique)”, Cemoti, Sayı 21, 1996, s.2
- Sibel Bozdoğan, Modernizm ve Ulusun İnşası (Modernism and Construction of the Nation), İstanbul, İletişim Yay., 2008, s.150.
- Nusret Ekin, Endüstri İlişkileri, Beşinci Baskı, İstanbul, 1989, pp. 1, 2, 3.
- Stewart Rose, Documenting The Past The Industtrial Revolution, Published by Oriental Press, Dubai, 2008, p. 8.
> Erduçgül Düzdag, İz Yay, İstanbul 1991, ss.XXXIX, XLVIII; M. Henefi Bostan, Said Halim Paşa mad., İA., İstanbul 2008, c. 35, ss. 557, 560; N. 
> Ahmet Özalp, Sunuş, Said Halim Paşa, Siyasal Kurumlar içinde, Pınar Yay., İstanbul 1987, ss. 9-14;
> Ertuçgül Düzdag, Said Halim Paşa Hayatı ve Eserleri, Buhranlarımız içinde, İz Yay., İstanbul 1991, ss. XIII, XXXVII;
> İsmail Kara, Türkiye’de İslamiçik Düşüncesi, Kitabevi Yay., İstanbul 1997, p. 17.
> Sünen-i Ebu Davut, Kitabu’l Melahim, I.hadis.
> Fazlırrahman, İslâm, Selçuk Yay, Ankara 1993, p. 268-294
> Hamit Er, Çağdaşlaşma ve Eğitim, Rağbet Yay., İstanbul, 1999, p.166
> Azmi Özcan, “Milliyetçilik mad.”, *İ.A.*, İstanbul, 2005, v. 30, p. 84, 85
> İliber Ortaylı, *İmparatorluğu'nun En Uzun Yüzyılı*, İletişim Yay., İstanbul 2000, p. 61
> İsmail Kara, *Türkiye'de İslâmcılık Dürlülcesi*, vol. I, p. 24, 25
> Bernard Lewis *Modern Türkiye'nin Doğuşu*, tr.: Metin Kıratlı , TTK.Yay., p. 56
> Halil İnalcık, “Osmanlı Toplum Yapısının Evrimi”, *Türkiye Günlüğü*, 1990, Yaz Dönemi, p.30, 41
**İSLAM TASAVVUF DÜŞÜNCEŞİNDE İLİM-ÂLEM İLİŞKİSİ MUHYİDDİN İBN-İ ARABI ÖRNEĞİ**


Batı terminolojisindeki mistisizm, doğu, özellikle de İslam terminolojisindeki tasavvuf, dini hayatın daha etkili, daha derin yaşanmasını ifade eder. Buna göre de tasavvuf bağlamında bilgi ve bilime baktığımızda Kur'an ve hadis referanslı bilgi ve bilim anlayışı oldukça önemlidir.

İslâm tasavvuf geleneğinin önemli isimlerinden olan Muhyiddin İbnü'l Arabi (Öl. 1239)'nin bilgi ve bilim anlayışının temelinde de elbette Kur'an ve hadis en önemli kaynaklardır. Bu sebeple İslâm tasavvuf geleneğinin ve özellikle de Muhyiddin İbnü'l Arabi’nin bilgi ve bilim anlayışına da kaynaklık eden Kur’an ve hadis’deki bilgi ve bilim konusundaki teşvik edici metinlerden birkaçına burada yer vermeye çalışacağız.

Öncelikle Kur’an da ki bilgi ve bilime işaret eden ve müslümanın bilgi ve bilime sahip olmasını isteyen ayetlerden birkaç şu şekildedir:

"... Eğer bilmiyorsanız zikir (ilim) ehline sorunuz."

"... ‘Rabbin benim ilmimi artır’ de.”

"... (Ey Muhammed) de ki: Hiç bilenlerle bilmeyenler bir olur mu? Doğrusu ancak akıl sahipleri bunları hakkaıyla düşünür.”

"Yaratkan Rabbinin adıyla oku! O, insanı bir kan phıtsından yarattı. Otu ve öğren! İnsana bilmediklerini öğretten ve kalemle yazdıran Rabbın ekremdir (en cömerttir)”

"Bir de kendilerine ilim verilenler onun (Kur’an’ın) hakikaten Rabbın tarafından gelmiş bir gerçek olduğunu bilsinler de ona inansınlar...”

---

96 Nahl süresi, âyet 43; Enbiyâ süresi âyet 7
97 Taha süresi, âyet 114
98 Zümer süresi, âyet 9
99 Alak süresi, âyet 1–5
100 Hac süresi, âyet 54

50